



Ministry Assessment Format (MAF)

Programming Division, Planning Commission
Ministry of Planning
Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh

March 2018



A H M Mustafa Kamal, FCA, MP
Minister, Ministry of Planning
and
Vice-Chairman, Bangladesh Planning Commission
Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh

Message

The Government of Bangladesh has been implementing the 7th Five Year Plan (7FYP) to achieve the goals and targets envisioned in "Vision 2021", and our achievements are quite visible in most of the socio-economic indicators including Gross Domestic Product (GDP) growth rate. However, challenges remain to be addressed. Critically, public investment in all sectors needs to be better managed for maximising value for money and providing an enabling environment for private sector investment. Our Government fully recognises its importance and has made a commitment in the 7FYP to implement Public Investment Management (PIM) reforms.

In this context, I am pleased to learn that Programming Division of Bangladesh Planning Commission is going to launch a set of new PIM tools which will eventually improve the current PIM system in Bangladesh. I expect that the proper usage of these tools will strengthen strategic linkages among national plans, public investment, and budgeting, thereby achieving the national goals and targets in a more efficient, effective, and timely manner. Furthermore, I am glad to know that these new PIM tools have been thoroughly tested and validated in two pilot sectors- i) Power & Energy, and ii) Local Government & Rural Development. In due course, these will be rolled out to other Sectors and Ministries, Divisions and Agencies.

I would like to take the opportunity to congratulate the team of Government officials and experts of the "Strengthening Public Investment Management System (SPIMS)" project, supported by Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), who have successfully developed these PIM tools as part of PIM reform. Finally, I would like to express my heartfelt appreciation for the Government of Japan in their financial and technical support as well as friendship extended towards Bangladesh since our independence.

(A H M Mustafa Kamal, FCA, MP)



M. A. Mannan, MP

State Minister

Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Planning
Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh

Message

It is my pleasure to put forward a set of new Public Investment Management (PIM) tools to my colleagues at the Planning Commission, Ministry of Planning, Ministry of Finance, and the Ministries, Divisions and Agencies (MDAs) under the Power & Energy Sector and the Local Government & Rural Development Sector.

The new PIM tools comprise the i) Ministry Assessment Format (MAF), ii) Sector Appraisal Format (SAF), iii) Sector Strategy Paper (SSP), and iii) Multi-Year Public Investment Programme (MYPIP). I congratulate all public officials and experts who contributed to developing these tools through close collaboration and hard work under the Strengthening Public Investment Management System (SPIMS) Project. My special thanks go to the Programming Division of the Planning Commission for their excellent leadership and the initiative to engage a broad range of stakeholders in the process of developing these tools.

As State Minister in charge of the Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Planning, I have a few remarks to make regarding the new PIM tools.

First, the new PIM tools will contribute significantly to the implementation of two major governance reform initiatives – the Public Financial Management (PFM) Reform Strategy led by the Ministry of Finance, and the PIM Reforms led by Planning Commission, Ministry of Planning. Both reforms will require close collaboration between the two central ministries that are tasked to manage the national budget of the Government. I am very pleased that the new PIM tools have been developed through close collaboration between them.

Second, I am also delighted that the MDAs in the two pilot sectors have played an instrumental role throughout the Project. I would like to thank all the officers who participated in various seminars, workshops and consultation meetings and provided extremely useful feedback and comments to make the PIM tools relevant and effective in their day-to-day work at their respective assignments.

Last, but not least, I would like to thank the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) for their technical and financial support for the project, and the Government of Japan for continued partnership and friendship with the Government of Bangladesh and Bangladeshi people. I believe and do hope that our partnership will make even stronger progress for many more years to come.


(M. A. Mannan, MP)



Md. Ziaul Islam
Member, Programming Division
&
Secretary, Planning Division
Ministry of Planning
Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh

Foreword

The Strengthening Public Investment Management System (SPIMS) project is seeking to improve Public Investment Management (PIM) capacity with strengthened linkages between public investment projects and national development policies and fiscal frameworks. The Project is co-financed by the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA). The Project is being implemented by the Programming Division of the Planning Commission, supported by a JICA Expert Team (JET). Crucially, four key PIM tools have been developed under this project, namely the i) Ministry Assessment Format (MAF), ii) Sector Appraisal Format (SAF), iii) Sector Strategy Paper (SSP), and iv) Multi-Year Public Investment Programme (MYPIP). Of these tools, the MAF is focused on improving project formulation and appraisal practices.

In respect of Project Formulation and Appraisal, the SPIMS project conducted a diagnostic study of the Development Project Proposal (DPP) /Technical Assistance Project Proposal (TAPP) process and identified key issues that caused delay in the process and low quality of project design. This study suggested to standardise the DPP appraisal process by introducing the MAF for Ministry/Division-level project assessment. With a view to introducing a standard and structured system for project assessment across all Ministries /Divisions, the SPIMS project has developed the MAF through a series of meetings and validated it in workshops with key stakeholders of the two Pilot Sectors as well as the concerned Sector Divisions of the Planning Commission. The MAF thus developed was subsequently endorsed by the Project Steering Committee (PSC).

The value and utility of any new tools or instruments lie in their use. Unless they are used practically and applied through the system, the purpose of developing these new instruments will remain unachieved. For realising the desired benefits of the new PIM tools, it is necessary to start practicing them in the Pilot Ministries/Divisions/Agencies (MDAs) and also to roll them out to other MDAs in future. With this end in view, the MAF was presented before the National Coordination Committee (NCC) of the SPIMS Project chaired by the Hon'ble Minister for Planning.

The NCC approved the adoption and use of the MAF within concerned MDAs. It needs to be mentioned here that this new PIM tool is aimed to strengthen and supplement the existing Government procedures for designing, processing, and assessing the DPP by the Ministry/Division and has been prepared in line and in full conformity with the Planning Division's "Procedures for preparation, processing, approval and revision of Development Projects in the Public Sector", dated October 2016.

I strongly believe that use of the MAF will facilitate and improve the existing PIM system and bring about qualitative change in the whole process of project preparation, appraisal, approval, and implementation.

(Md. Ziaul Islam)



Md. Syeedul Haque

Chief, Programming Division

&

Project Director, SPIMS Project

Planning Commission, Ministry of Planning
Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh

Acknowledgements

A new format titled "Ministry Assessment Format (MAF)" has been developed by the "Strengthening Public Investment Management System (SPIMS) Project" of the Programming Division, Planning Commission. SPIMS is being implemented by the Programming Division of the Planning Commission and a JICA Expert Team (JET) provided technical support. The purpose of the SPIMS project is to deliver structural improvements in PIM capacity, with strengthened linkages between public investment projects, national development policies, and fiscal frameworks.

The Programming Division gratefully recognizes the financial support of the Government of Japan and technical assistance of JICA in the implementation of the SPIMS project. The concerned officials of the JICA Bangladesh Office were actively involved in the implementation of the project activities for which they deserve special appreciation and thanks.

The members of the Sector Working Groups (SWGs) in the two pilot sectors of i) Power & Energy and ii) Local Government & Rural Development provided very useful contribution, guidance, and inputs in the process of developing the PIM tools. The SPIMS project benefited immensely from the expert opinions of the members of the SWGs. We recognize their contributions with thanks and gratitude. We would also like to thank all the officials of the pilot Ministries/Divisions, Sector Divisions and GED of Planning Commission, IMED, ERD and Finance Division as well as those of the relevant agencies who cooperated with the SPIMS team in meeting and helping them with information and data.

We are extremely grateful to the respected Members of the Agriculture, Water Resources and Rural Institutions Division, Physical Infrastructure Division and Industry and Energy Division of the Planning Commission for kindly organising and chairing consultation meetings on the new PIM tools developed by the SPIMS Project and providing very useful suggestions for improving these documents.

The Member, Programming Division and Secretary, Planning Division lent invaluable support through his vast experience and able guidance as the Chair of the Project Steering Committee (PSC) in carrying forward the project activities. His unequivocal support was the greatest source of our inspiration. We are grateful to him.

The Hon'ble State Minister for the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Planning deserves thanks for his advice and guidance in the implementation of the SPIMS project.

We are also indebted to the Hon'ble Minister for Planning for approving the new PIM tools with the valuable instruction for utilising/practicing these tools by the Pilot Ministries/Divisions, Agencies and related Sector Divisions of Planning Commission.

Finally, we owe our thanks to all the members of the Project Implementation Unit (PIU), JET team and the local consultants for their dedication and hard work for the project. Without their unswerving endeavours and knowledge of best practice of PIM in other countries it would not have been possible to develop the new PIM tools.

The Programming Division looks forward to the cooperation of all concerned and their similar involvement in the next steps for using the new PIM tools as well as roll out of these tools to other sectors, Ministries/Divisions and Agencies, towards achieving the ultimate purpose and goal of the project.

(Md. Syeedul Haque)

Table of Contents

Cover Page: Ministry Assessment Format (MAF)	1
Compliance A: Project compliance checklist before conducting assessment	2
A-1: Feasibility Study	2
A-2: Inclusion in the current ADP/RADP	2
A-3: Foreign Aid/ Loan.....	2
Compliance B: Social and Environmental Checklist	2
B-1: Land Acquisition.....	2
B-2: Compensation and/ or Rehabilitation/Resettlement	2
B-3: Environmental impact	2
Part I: Basic Information on the Project	3
Part II: Clarity of the Log Frame	4
1. Project Purpose	4
2. Project Goal	5
3. Outputs.....	6
4. Inputs.....	8
Part III: Land Acquisition and Involvement of Compensation, Rehabilitation/ Resettlement	10
Part IV: Environmental Requirements	12
Part V: Sector Specific Analysis/ Sector-Specific Requirements	13
Part VI: Cost-Benefit Analysis	14
1. The calculated values of the performance indicators	15
2. Economic Analysis	15
3. Financial Analysis.....	16
Part VII: Evaluation Criteria	17
1. Relevance.....	17
2. Effectiveness	19
3. Efficiency.....	19
4. Impact.....	22
5. Sustainability	24
6. Risk and Mitigation Measures during Operation.....	26

DPP Ministry Assessment Format (MAF)

This format outlines the criteria for assessment of new Development Project Proposals (DPPs) submitted to the Sponsoring Ministry/Division for approval of the competent authority. The assessment is to be completed by the Planning Wings in the relevant Ministry/Division by scrutinizing the submitted DPP and attached documents, as well as conducting hearings with the Agencies/Departments responsible for formulating the project. This format is a supplementary document to be utilised by the Project Assessment Committee (PAC), formally called the Project Scrutinizing Committee (PSC). The following points/aspects need to be assessed:

[Part I] Basic Information on the Project;

[Part II] Clarity of the Log Frame;

[Part III] Land Acquisition, Compensation and Rehabilitation/ Resettlement Issues;

[Part IV] Environmental Requirements;

[Part V] Sector-Specific Analysis/ Sector-Specific Requirements;

[Part VI] Cost-Benefit Analysis; and

[Part VII] Evaluation Criteria (Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact, Sustainability and Risks & Mitigation Measures).

Project Name: _____

Date of signature in DPP by officer(s) responsible for DPP preparation: _____

Date of signature in DPP by the Head of Agency: _____

Date of receipt of DPP by Ministry/Division: _____

Date of receipt of DPP by the Desk Officer: _____

Ministry Assessment (preparation) Track Record

Date	Activity conducted	Follow-up requirements
	Beginning of Project Assessment	
	Completion of draft Project Assessment	
	Project Assessment Committee (PAC) Meeting	
	Issuing of Minutes of PAC Meeting along with Draft Project Assessment to all concerned	
	Ministry receives recast DPP from Agency	
	Desk Officer receives recast DPP	
	Completion of recast Project Assessment	

Date of endorsement of the recast DPP by the Chairperson, PAC and the Head, Ministry / Division: _____

Date of Submission of the recast DPP along with recast Project Assessment to the concerned Sector Division, Planning Commission: _____

Compliance A: Project compliance checklist before conducting assessment

NOTE: If any answer to the questions of b) in A-1, A-2 and A-3 is “No”, the DPP should be sent back to the Agency.

A-1: Feasibility Study [Item 16.0 of the DPP]

a) Is the cost of proposed projects more than TK. 25 crore? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes (→go to b)	<input type="checkbox"/> No (→skip b & c)
b) Was feasibility study approved? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes (→go to c)	<input type="checkbox"/> No (→skip c, and the DPP should be sent back to the Agency)
c) If the answer to b) is “YES”, please write the date of approval and appendix number of the DPP.	
Date of Approval:	Appendix Number:

A-2: Inclusion in the current ADP/RADP [List of unapproved projects in current ADP/RADP]

a) Is the proposed project included in the list of unapproved new projects of the current ADP/RADP? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes (→skip b & c)	<input type="checkbox"/> No (→go to b)
b) Did the Minister / State Minister of Planning approve the processing of the proposed unapproved new project, not included in the current ADP/ RADP? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes (→go to c)	<input type="checkbox"/> No (→skip c, and the DPP should be sent back to the Agency)
c) If the answer to b) is “YES”, please write the date of approval and appendix number of the DPP.	
Date of Approval:	Appendix Number:

A-3: Foreign Aid/ Loan [Item 6.0 of the DPP]

a) Is the proposed project to be financed fully or partially from Foreign Aid (loan)? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes (→go to b)	<input type="checkbox"/> No (→skip b & c)
b) Was the Preliminary DPP approved? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes (→go to c)	<input type="checkbox"/> No (→skip c, and the DPP should be sent back to the Agency)
c) If the answer to b) is “YES”, please write the date of approval and appendix number of the DPP.	
Date of Approval:	Appendix Number:

Compliance B: Social and Environmental Checklist

NOTE: If the answer to any of the following questions is “Yes”, the proposed project will be carefully assessed in terms of its compliance with relevant rules and regulations.

B-1: Land Acquisition [Economic Code 6900, item 9.0 of the DPP]

a) Does the proposed project require land acquisition? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input type="checkbox"/> No if yes, please fulfil the questions in Part III

B-2: Compensation and/ or Rehabilitation/Resettlement [Item 30.0 of the DPP]

a) Does the proposed project involve compensation and/or rehabilitation/resettlement? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input type="checkbox"/> No if yes, please fulfil the questions in Part III

B-3: Environmental impact [Item 25.0 of the DPP]

a) Is the environmental category of the proposed project, Orange Ka, Orange Kha, or Red? (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	<input type="checkbox"/> No if yes, please fulfil the questions in Part IV

Part I: Basic Information on the Project

1. Sponsoring Ministry/Division:

2. Implementing Agency:

3. Concerned Sector Division of
the Planning Commission

4. Planned Duration of Project:
(Month, Year)

Start:

Completion:

Duration in months:

5. Estimated Cost of the Project
(in lakh Taka):

		Months	(Funding Source)/ (mode of Financing)
	GOB:	lakh	
	PA:	lakh	
	Own fund:	lakh	
	Others:	lakh	
	Total:	lakh	

6. Project Location:

Part II: Clarity of the Log Frame

This part examines the clarity of the Narrative Summary and Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVIs) at each level of the project's Log Frame. **(Refer to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) of DPP)**

1. Project Purpose

[NOTE] The Project Purpose is A DIRECT RESULT of the project, expected to be achieved at the time of completion.

1) Is the Project Purpose in the Narrative Summary stated clearly?

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background), and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

2) Are the Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVIs) for the Project Purpose set up clearly?

✓ [Note] OVIs should clearly capture the essence of the narrative summary and should be SMART (Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant, and Time-bound), and include QQTL (Quantity, Quality, Time and Location) details.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background), and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

2. Project Goal

[Note] The Project Goal is the expected outcome to be achieved gradually within 2-5 years after the project's completion. The Project Goal of the proposed project should be measurable as a direct impact from the project, rather than an indirect level such as development targets of the sector.

1) Is the Project Goal in the Narrative Summary stated clearly?

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background) and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

2) Are the Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVIs) for the Project Goal set up clearly?

✓ [Note] OVIs should clearly capture the essence of the narrative summary and should be SMART (Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant, and Time-bound), and include QQTL (Quantity, Quality, Time and Location) details.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background) and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

3) Are important assumptions (external assumptions) of Project Purpose level indicated appropriately as conditions of Project Goal achievement?

✓ [Note] Important Assumptions are critical factors uncontrollable by the project, which could affect the achievement of the planned results and have implications for the project's intervention logic.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on the important assumptions between the Project Goal and the Project Purpose, including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background) and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

3. Outputs

[Note] Outputs are important divided components to achieve the project purpose/ results or deliverables towards fulfilling objectives of the project.

1) Are the Outputs in the Narrative Summary stated clearly? Are they properly aligned so that they are not duplicating one another?

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background) and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

2) Are the OVIs for each of the Outputs set up clearly?

- ✓ [Note] OVIs should clearly capture the essence of the narrative summary and should be SMART (Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant, and Time-bound), and include QQTL (Quantity, Quality, Time and Location) details.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background) and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

3) Are important assumptions (external assumptions) of this level indicated appropriately as conditions of Project Purpose achievement?

- ✓ [Note] Important Assumptions are critical factors uncontrollable by the project, which could affect the achievement of the planned results and have implications for the project's intervention logic.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on the important assumptions between the Project Purpose and Outputs, including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 3.0 (Objectives and Targets), 14.0 (Background) and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

4. Inputs

[Note] Inputs are resources required to achieve the project outputs

- 1) **Manpower** formulation of the project (refer to DPP items 11.1, 13.1 & 13.2, 31.0, Annexure 2).
State the posts required for the project and their status within the Agency.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Annexure 2 as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as items 11.1, 13.1 & 13.2, 31.0, as additional sources of information.

	Name of proposed post	Number of same or mutually transferable posts within the Agency under the Revenue Budget	Number of existing posts	
			During Implementation	After Implementation

b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
 Information is available Information is Not available (→ skip c)

c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
 Appropriate as indicated Needs amendment

d) Remarks and Suggestions

(Examples)

- Please provide information on the required manpower for O&M.
- Please indicate whether the newly recruited officers and employees under the project would be transferred to revenue budget or not.
- Please provide information from the organisation set-up and manpower allocation, and situation analysis paper.

- 2) **Cost** comparison with other completed (or approved) projects of the same nature (refer to item 20.0 of the DPP).

Note: DPP and/or evidence of costs to be compared must be attached as supporting documents.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 20.0 (comparative cost) as the main source of information.

Sl. No.	Major Items	Unit	Unit Cost of the Item			Remarks
			Proposed Project	Similar Ongoing Project	Similar completed Project	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7

b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
 Information is available Information is Not available (→ skip c)

c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
 Appropriate as indicated Needs amendment

d) Remarks and Suggestions

3) Are **Project Inputs** aligned clearly to achieve their Outputs?

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 14.0 (Background), and 15.0 (Project Description) as an additional source of information.
<i>(Examples)</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Programme inputs are indicated in the Log Frame (item 10, page x). ● Item-wise Costs comparison with other projects is indicated on page xx. ● Location wise cost breakdown is indicated on page xx (Annexure 1) ● PIU structure and manpower formulation are indicated on page xx (Annexure 2) ● Total procurement plan is indicated on page xx (Annexure 3) ● Year-wise physical and financial plan is indicated on pages xx (Annexure 4) ● Detailed annual phasing of cost is indicated on pages xx (Annexure 5) ● Amortization Schedule is on page xx (Annexure 6) ● Detailed list of items with cost is indicated in Appendix xx ● Summary of cost for construction materials and equipment is indicated in Appendix xx ● Cost of office equipment, computer and furniture is indicated in Appendix xx ● Required vehicles, maintenance and fuel expenses are indicated in Appendix xx ● Operation and maintenance costs are indicated in Appendix xx ● Land acquisition and procurement costs are indicated in Appendix xx ● Financial and Economic Analysis of the project is indicated in Appendix xx ● Training facilities costs are indicated in Appendix xx
b) check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

4) Are important assumptions and preconditions indicated appropriately as conditions for the achievement of each Output?

✓ [Note] Important Assumptions are critical factors uncontrollable by the project, which could affect the achievement of the planned results and have implications for the project's intervention logic.

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on both the important assumptions between Outputs and Inputs, and the preconditions; including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 10.0 (Log Frame) as the main source of information, and also to other Items such as Items 14.0 (Background), and 15.0 (Project Description) as additional sources of information.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

Part III: Land Acquisition and Involvement of Compensation, Rehabilitation/ Resettlement

1 Category of Land: Does the Project require the acquisition of land? If yes, are both the quantity and the category of the land to be acquisitioned clearly stated?

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
 - Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (d) Advance plan for acquisition of land along with adoption of conservative policy in determining the size /quantity of land required for the project and discourage acquisition of agricultural land.

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 9.0: Estimated Cost Summary (Economic Code 6900: Land acquisition) ● 10.0: Log Frame (INPUT) ● 30.0: Compensation, Rehabilitation/ Resettlement [Attachment] Resettlement Action Plan [Attachment] Letter of Local Authority related to land value, estimation of compensation etc.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

2. Basis of cost estimation: For projects requiring land acquisition, is the prevailing market price from the office of the concerned Revenue/ Sub-Registrar/ Upazila Land Officer/ Deputy Commissioner stated and attached to the DPP?

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
 - Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (d) Advance plan for acquisition of land along with adoption of conservative policy in determining the size /quantity of land required for the project and discourage acquisition of agricultural land.

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 30.0: Compensation, Rehabilitation/ Resettlement [Attachment] Resettlement Action Plan [Attachment] Letter of Local Authority related to land value, estimation of compensation etc.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

3. Compensation, Rehabilitation/ Resettlement: Does the project involve compensation, rehabilitation/ resettlement? If so, is the required compensation in line with the Real Property Acquisition and Acquisition Act, 2017?

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
 - Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (d) Advance Plan for acquisition of land along with adoption of conservative policy in determining the size /quantity of land required for the project and discourage acquisition of agricultural land.

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 30.0: Compensation, Rehabilitation/ Resettlement [Attachment] Resettlement Action Plan [Attachment] Letter of Local Authority related to land value, estimation of compensation etc.
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

Part IV: Environmental Requirements

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
- Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (c) Analysis of possible risks that may arise during implementation of the project and remedial measures thereof
- Para 1.1.7: Analysis of the impact of the project on environment, climate change and other cross cutting areas/issues

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 24.0: The effect/impact, adaptation, and specific mitigation measures thereof if any on (ii) environment sustainability. ● 25.0: Whether environmental clearance under the ECA 1995 (Revised 2010) has been obtained? (If yes, attached the certificate. If not, mention the cause) 	
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available	<input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (➔ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated	<input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment

1. Environmental Category for this Project (Please tick the box)

- Red
- Orange B (Kha)
- Orange A (Ka)
- Green

Note: To check the Environmental Category, please refer to Schedule 1 of the Environment Conservation Rules 1997.

2. Has the Project obtained an Environmental Clearance Certificate (ECC) stipulated under the Environment Conservation Act 1995? If the Project is rated as in the Red Category, is the EIA document attached?

NOTE: an ECC is required for all projects

Reference

Table of category-wise required documents to obtain the ECC

	Category	NOC	F/S	IEE	EMP	EIA
1	Red	Required	Required	Required	Required	Required
2	Orange B (Kha)	Required	Required	Required	Required	Not Required
3	Orange A (Ka)	Required	Not Required	Not Required	Not Required	Not Required
4	Green	Required	Not Required	Not Required	Not Required	Not Required

[Legend] F/S: Feasibility Study Report, NOC: Non-Objection Certificate from Local Authority, IEE: Initial Environmental Examination Report, EIA: Environmental Impact Assessment Report, ECC: Environmental Clearance Certificate, EMP: Environmental Mitigation Plan.

a) Environmental Category	b) An EIA and/or ECC is attached (Yes / No)	c) Additional Remarks

Part V: Sector Specific Analysis/ Sector-Specific Requirements

Requirements of national/ sectoral/ regional standards	Remarks	Check

Part VI: Cost-Benefit Analysis

Reference

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Item 17.0: Financial Analysis (and Economic Analysis) (attach calculation sheets) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Para 1.1.1. Consistency with short, medium and long-term development plan, policy and strategy: (d) Justification for taking the project in the context of the overall economic situation in the country ● Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (f) Conducting realistic financial and economic analysis
<p>This section covers the financial and/or economic analysis of the proposed project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Economic Analysis (EA) aims to provide the justification for “taking the project in the context of the overall economic situation in the country” (para 1.1.1. (d). The discount rate prescribed by the GOB is called the social discount rate (SDR). If the EIRR>SDR then a project is considered to contribute sufficiently to the welfare of the country and thereby justifies its inclusion in the ADP. This aligns with the fiscal policy principle of economic efficiency. EA tries to monetize all significant positive and negative impacts/ aspects of a project on the welfare of society. The calculation process involves: (i) categorizing the inputs and outputs in traded goods, non-traded goods, production factors and externalities; (ii) using data on conversion factors and Willingness to Pay values; and finally (iii) calculating the IRR, NPV, and BCR of the proposed project. ● The Financial Analysis (FA) provides information on financing needs, profitability and financial sustainability of a project. FA can calculate full cost recovery levels for setting user prices for the products and services generated by the project. The key profitability indicator is the financial rate or return on total investment (FIRR) and on equity capital (FIRRc); the FNPV and the FBCR provide additional information at a glance. ● The Net Present Value (NPV) shows present (when the project is being formulated) value of all the stream of costs and benefits over the economic lifetime of a project. NPV is calculated using discounting techniques and a given discount factor. While in EA this is a social discount rate (SDR), in FA this is a market interest rate of discount (MDR). NPV>0 means that the Net benefit (the difference between the NPV of all revenues/benefits and the NPV of all costs) is positive, given the specified discount rate. ● The Benefit Cost Ratio (BCR) gives a relative indicator of project performance. A BCR>1.1 means that the NPV of the project benefits are 10% bigger than the NPV of project costs. A BCR=1 means that the NPV of benefits and the NPV of the costs are the same at the given discount rate. ● The Internal Rate of Return (IRR) shows the return on investment. The IRR shows the discount rate which gives an NPV of zero for the project’s net cash flow of non-financial operations. If EA shows that the EIRR>SDR then the project performance will be better than the welfare benchmark defined by the GOB with the SDR; If FA shows that FIRR>MDR then this means the project will be profitable for all stakeholders. ● The indicators Economic IRR, NPV and BCR are expressed in constant prices. The calculations are done by applying the discounted cash flow technique (DCF) to the net cash flow of non-financial operations. The government sets one discount rate for Financial Analysis (FA) (all sectors) and one separate discount rate for Economic Analysis (EA). Note that the discount rate for analysis in constant prices should differ from the discount rate in nominal prices by a percentage approximately equal to the inflation rate. 	
<p>Special issues for the assessment by the Ministry</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Type of project: income generating or non-income generating ● Is incremental analysis applicable and used correctly? ● Source and reliability of the costing data ● Inputs costs, benefits/outcomes/impact ● Are constant prices used for the FRR, IRR and NPV calculations? ● Assumptions about demand for the project services, and sensitivity of the FA results to the assumptions ● Other key assumptions spelt out; any assumptions about relative price changes? ● Correctness of DCF calculations ● Value of the economic prices and conversion factors used for the EA ● Are all significant impacts included in the Economic Analysis (land, resettlement, environment and GHG emissions)? ● Financing needs and justification given for the mix of financing sources 	

1. The calculated values of the performance indicators

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 17.0 and relevant appendices.

Financial and Economic Analysis: Performance indicators values in Lakh Taka

	Discount Rate	NPV	BCR	IRR
Financial				
Economic				

b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)

Information is available Information is Not available (→ skip c)

c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)

Appropriate as indicated Needs amendment

d) Remarks and Suggestions

(Examples)

- Capital Cost is shown in Appendix XX.
- Operating Cost is shown in Appendix XX.
- Benefit is shown in Appendix XX
- Assumptions for Financial Analysis are explained in Appendix XX.
- Assumptions for Economic Analysis are explained in Appendix XX.
- The number of potential customers/clients is not identified clearly in Appendix xx.
- How to reach all potential consumers/clients is not clear in the assumption shown in Appendix xxx

2. Economic Analysis

1. Net Present Value (Refer to DPP page _____ / Attachment _____)

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 17.0 and relevant appendices.

- Key assumption on demand development: -----
- Economic NPV: discount rate used: -----
- Economic NPV: taxation (transfers removed):
- Time horizon of the project; and years covered by the DCF analysis:
- Economic conversion factor values:
- Standard conversion factor (SCF):
- Shadow wage rates: SWR unskilled labour: ---- SWR skilled labour; -----
- Traded goods: are border prices used?

b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)

Information is available Information is Not available (→ skip c)

c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)

Appropriate as indicated Needs amendment

d) Remarks and Suggestions

2. Benefit-Cost Ratio (Refer to DPP page _____ / Attachment _____)

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 17.0 and relevant appendices.
● Economic BCR value: discount rate used: ----
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

3. Internal Rate of Return (Refer to DPP page _____ / Attachment _____)

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 17.0 and relevant appendices.
● Economic IRR: discount rate used: ----- ● Sensitivity analysis done? ● Sensitivity analysis results? ● Switching values available for most significant factors?
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

3. Financial Analysis

1. IRR, NPV and BCR (Refer to DPP page _____ / Attachment _____)

a) Write/ copy the description provided in the DPP on this aspect including the location within the DPP/attachment, by referring to Item 17.0 and relevant appendices.
● FNPV: discount rate used: ----- ● FNPV: Taxation included in the investment cost? ● FIRR: discount rate used: -----; ● FBCR value: discount rate used: ---- ;
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

Part VII: Evaluation Criteria

[Note] While conducting criteria analysis, one should refer to the following four DPP items: 10.0 Log Frame; 16.0 Pre-appraisal/ pre-investment study; 17.0 Cost Benefit Analysis; and 18.0 Lessons learnt, as the information contained within those items can be used to analyse all aspects covered under the Evaluation Criteria .

1. Relevance

(1) Consistency with Strategies, Programmes and Plans: Is the project included in the strategies, development plans and programmes stipulated by the Government / Sector? Are the Project Goal and Project Purpose consistent with these?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book 2016:: ➤ Para 1.1.1 Consistency with short, medium and long-term development plan, policy and strategy: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Consider the objectives and targets of the Five Year Plan and Perspective Plan ; (b) Consider the National Sustainable Development Strategy, the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) declared by the United Nations and the Development Goals adopted by other International Organisations; and (c) Selection of suitable/ appropriate Projects based on priority in implementing Policies of the concerned Ministry/ Division
--

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 14.0: Background ● 15.0: Project Description ● 26.0: Linkage ● 27.1. Vision and Mission of MDA ● 27.2: Allocation of Business of Ministry/ Division 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● MAF Part 2, 1. Project Purpose ● MAF Part 2, 2. Project Goal
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available	<input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated	<input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions	

(2) Consistency with financing resources (Ministry/Division-Level Multi-Year Public Investment Programme (MYPIP) if available and/or Medium-Term Budget Framework (MTBF)): Is the financing secured for the project?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.2 Consideration of availability of resources: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Projects should be prepared on the basis of rational cost estimates, keeping the expenditure within the MTBF ceiling, and justifying appropriateness through certification; and (b) Preparing one comprehensive project instead of preparing more than one small and separate projects having same or similar objectives/ nature.

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 6.2: Year wise cost ● 12.2: Year wise target (Annexure 4) ● 21.0: Annual phasing of cost (Annexure 5) ● 23.0: Amortization Schedule ● (If the project is not included in the list of unapproved new project/ list of Pipeline Projects of ADP/RADP, the decision to proceed the proposed project should first be endorsed by the Planning Minister.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● MAF Part 1. 4. Estimated Cost of the Project
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available	<input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated	<input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions	

(3) Beneficiaries: Are the project beneficiaries appropriately identified? Does the Project Purpose match the needs of the beneficiaries?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.5 Poverty alleviation and removal of regional disparity: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) For removing regional disparity in the context of the socio-economic situation, priority should be given to selection of projects from the backward/ less developed areas of the country and specific information on the project beneficiary group needs to be incorporated. (b) It should be ensured that the lion's share of the allocation of the Poverty Alleviation Projects reaches the beneficiaries directly.
--

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 3.0: Objectives and Targets ● 14.0: Background ● 15.0: Project Description (15.6: Population Coverage)
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(4) Project Location: Can the Project Purpose be achieved given the location(s) where the project will be implemented?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.5 Poverty alleviation and removal of regional disparity: (c): The location of the project should be decided/ selected keeping in view the policy of ensuring the project benefits reach all Divisions and Districts for ensuring balanced development in all the areas of the country

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 7.0: Location of the project [Appendix: Map] ● MAF Part 1, 3. Summary of Project Location
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

2. Effectiveness

(1) Are the Outputs identified appropriately so that the Project Purpose would be achieved?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ 1.1.2 Consideration of availability of resources: (b) Prepare one comprehensive project instead of preparing more than one small and separate projects having same or similar objectives/ nature.
--

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 10.0: Log Frame ● 14.0: Background ● 15.0: Project Description ● MAF Part 2, 1. Project Purpose ● MAF Part 2, 3. Outputs
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

3. Efficiency

(1) Is the **cost estimation** of the project appropriate and reliable?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.4 Justification of the cost estimates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Justification for the estimated costs of the various components of the project and component wise-cost estimates and preparation of realistic /rational cost estimates for consultants, manpower, seminar and training etc. (b) Justification for procurement of consultants and vehicles for the project
--

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 11.1: Project management setup (Annexure 2) ● 19.0: Basis of cost estimation ● 20.0: Comparative cost ● MAF Part 2, 4. Inputs
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(2) Is the **duration of the project** reasonable? Is the schedule of the project reasonable, considering seasonal/functional fluctuations?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.3 Consideration of results of the projects of same nature /type and avoidance of duplication: (a) Consider results and experience of implementing a similar project completed earlier or under implementation at present.

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 4.0: Project implementation period ● 12.1: Procurement Plan (Annexure 3) ● 12.2: Year wise Financial and Physical Target Plan (Annexure 4) ● 21.0: Detailed Annual Phasing of Cost (Annexure 5) ● MAF Part 1, 4. Planned Duration of the Project
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)

c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(3) Is the **manpower** required for the implementation management of the project sufficient to conduct activities and achieve the Outputs?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Para 1.1.4 Justification of the cost estimates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (b) Justification for procurement of consultants and vehicles for the project (e) Avoiding employment of new manpower for the project as far as possible and in case of necessity consider service outsourcing

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 11.1: Project management setup (Annexure 2)
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(4) Are the **materials, equipment, facilities and technology** required for the implementation of the project sufficient to conduct activities and achieve the Outputs?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Para 1.1.4 Justification of the cost estimates: (a) Justification for the estimated costs of the various components of the project and component wise-cost estimates and preparation of realistic /rational cost estimates for consultants, manpower, seminar and training etc.
--

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 22.0: Specification of major items [Appendix of 22.0]
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(5) Are there any important controllable and uncontrollable **risks that are liable to affect the implementation of the project?**

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
 - Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (c) Analysis of possible risks that may arise during implementation of the project and remedial measures thereof.

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 10.0 Log Frame "Important Assumptions" ● 31.0 Risk analysis and mitigation measures (during implementation)
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(6) What are the **mitigation measures considered for risks** that are indicated in (5) above?

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
 - Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (c) Analysis of possible risks that may arise during implementation of the project and remedial measures thereof

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 10.0 Log Frame "Important Assumptions" ● 31.0 Risk analysis and mitigation measures (during implementation)
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

4. Impact

(1) Negative Impact: Are there any possibilities of the Project and its activities generating negative social impacts (issues related to regional disparity, poverty, women and children)?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.4 Justification of the cost estimates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (c) Analysis of possible risks that may arise during implementation of the project and remedial measures thereof (d) Advance plan for acquisition of land along with adoption of conservative policy in determining the size /quantity of land required for the project and discourage acquisition of agricultural land. ➤ Para 1.1.7: Analysis of impact of the project on environment, climate change and other cross cutting areas/issues
--

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 24.0: Impact and mitigation measurement [Attachment] e.g. Gender Action Plan
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(2) Positive Impact (Ripple Effect): Are there likely to be any additional positive impact or ripple effects apart from the achievement of the Project Goal?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.7: Analysis of impact of the project on environment, climate change and other cross cutting areas/issues.

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 24.0: Impact and mitigation measures [Attachment] e.g. Gender Action Plan
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(3) Positive Impact (social): Are there likely to be any positive impact that improves social conditions (issues related to regional disparities, poverty, women and children)?

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
- Para 1.1.7: Analysis of impact of the project on environment, climate change and other cross cutting areas/issues

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
● 24.0: Impact and mitigation measures [Attachment] e.g. Gender Action Plan
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (→skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

5. Sustainability

(1) Financial Sustainability: Are there any documented plans for operation and maintenance after the project is completed, with clear foundation of financial resources to maintain realized effects by the project?

The key question of financial sustainability after project completion is whether the agency responsible for operations will have enough money to maintain the Operation and Maintenance (O&M) costs.

A project is **financially sustainable** if the Financial Analysis shows that expected liquidity and solvency situation is assessed as adequate.

The **liquidity situation** is adequate if the cumulative cash flow generated by the project is positive in all operational years.

The **solvency situation** is assessed as good if the operating agency has sufficient reserves (assets on its balance sheet) to make up for cash shortages up to three months of operations. The idea is that unforeseen and uncontrollable events can occur (Risks) which will have a negative effect on operations and cash generation. In that case, agency’s reserves will be needed to provide the cash needed for covering the operating expenditures (OPEX).

The **OPEX** covers: all inputs needed to provide the services which the project provides. This can include input costs like: fuel; manpower; vehicle costs; repair and maintenance costs of the facilities; financing costs (interest and amortisation payments); and taxes. Another word for all these costs together is **O&M costs**.

A distinction can be made between income generating and non-income generating projects.

Non-income generating projects include roads, bridges and others public goods for which there is no direct *user charge*. For this category of projects, the O&M costs will always put a claim on the revenue budget of the State; and or grants from NGOs, or PA.

Income generating projects include Infrastructure in Energy Networks, ICT networks, Ports and Rail, Agriculture, Education, Health etc. In this category there will be projects which generate sufficient revenues to fully cover O&M expenditures, and projects for which the user fees and other charges/revenue sources are insufficient to fully cover O&M costs.

In the latter case the project’s financial sustainability can only be assured if the Government or other sources of finance are available to make up for the difference.

Note that if the FIRR < market discount rate prescribed by GOB for the discounted cashflow analysis, a project will normally require grant financing of the investment amount or of the O&M expenditures.

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
 - Para 1.1.6 Making the project results sustainable:
 - (a) Furnish specific information on issues relating to the manpower for running the on-going project, for maintenance of the created establishment/ infrastructure of the completed project and all necessary information for its institutionalization and sustainability
 - (b) Plan for use of the equipment, furniture and vehicles procured under the project after project completion should be attached with the DPP
- Check whether nominal /current or real/constant prices have been used to calculate the future O&M funding needs

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 13.0: After completion, whether the project needs to be transferred to the revenue budget ● 31.0: Risk analysis and mitigation measures ● 32.1: Sustainability of the project benefit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● MAF Part 6. Cost Benefit Analysis <p>[Attachment] Operation and Maintenance Plan</p>
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available	<input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (➔ skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated	<input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions	

(2) Institutional Sustainability: Is the institutional setup for the project likely to be durable, enabling the project’s benefits to continue as planned?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.6 Making the project results sustainable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Furnish specific information on issues relating to the manpower for running the on-going project, for maintenance of the created establishment/ infrastructure of the completed project and all necessary information for its institutionalization and sustainability (b) Plan for use of the equipment, furniture and vehicles procured under the project after project completion should be attached with the DPP

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 13.0: After completion, whether the project needs to be transferred to the revenue budget ● 31.0: Risk analysis and mitigation measures ● 32.1: Sustainability of the project benefit <p>[Attachment] Operation and Maintenance Plan</p>
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (➔skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(3) Organisational Sustainability: Are there any documents that clearly state the responsible organisation(s) and/or groups for O&M?

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book: ➤ Para 1.1.6 Making the project results sustainable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Furnish specific information on issues relating to the manpower for running the on-going project, for maintenance of the created establishment/ infrastructure of the completed project and all necessary information for its institutionalization and sustainability (b) Plan for use of the equipment, furniture and vehicles procured under the project after project completion should be attached with the DPP

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 13.0: After completion, whether the project needs to be transferred to the revenue budget ● 31.0: Risk analysis and mitigation measures ● 32.1: Sustainability of the project benefit <p>[Attachment] e.g. Operation and Maintenance Plan</p>
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (➔skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

6. Risk and Mitigation Measures during Operation after project completion

(1) Are there any important controllable and uncontrollable **risks** that are liable to affect the project after its completion and during its operation?

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
- Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (c) Analysis of possible risks that may arise during implementation of the project and remedial measures thereof

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 10.0 Log Frame “Important Assumptions” ● 31.0 Risk analysis and mitigation measures (during operation).
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (➔skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions

(2) What are the **mitigation measures considered for risks** that are indicated in (1)?

- Examination aspects stipulated in the Green Book:
- Para 1.1.4 Justification for preparing the cost estimates: (c) Analysis of possible risks that may arise during implementation of the project and remedial measures thereof

a) Refer to the following items and relevant attachments
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 10.0 Log Frame “Important Assumptions” ● 31.0 Risk analysis and mitigation measures (during operation)
b) Check the availability of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Information is available <input type="checkbox"/> Information is Not available (➔skip c)
c) Check the quality of information (Please tick the box)
<input type="checkbox"/> Appropriate as indicated <input type="checkbox"/> Needs amendment
d) Remarks and Suggestions